

- it: in 1940 the Sabha published a book in Urdu entitled *Mulk Kī Zabān aur Fāzil Musalmān* [*The Language of the Country and Learned Muslims*] which contained statements by several Muslim scholars in favour of Hindi.
12. See the section of Chapter V entitled 'The Hindi-Urdu Controversy of the 1860s and 1870s'.
 13. Sohan Prasad, *Hindī aur Urdū Kī Layāī* (Gorakhpur: 1886), stanzas 280 and 281.
 14. The statistics may suggest more Hindi than was the case because we are not sure about the nature of the *language* of the materials written in the Nagari script. Highly Persianized Khari Boli could be, and was written in the Nagari script, as J. C. Lyall noted in 1900 of the court language in the Central Provinces. (See the section of Chapter V entitled 'The Persianization of Urdu'.)
 15. See the section of Chapter III entitled 'The Kaithi Script', and the sections of Chapter V entitled 'The 1900 Decision: The Machinery of Deliberation', and 'Epilogue'.
 16. See the section of Chapter V entitled 'The Nagari Pracharini Sabha of Banaras'.
 17. See the opening part of the section of Chapter III entitled 'An Analysis of Language Policy' where F. S. Growse explains some of the reasons of the preference of his countrymen for Urdu.

Appendix

Sources

The Hindi movement has generated a considerable literature in many different forms: pamphlets, petitions, government administrative reports, newspaper articles, census reports, histories of literature, dictionaries, journal articles, dramas, poems, autobiographies, scholarly monographs, and organizational histories and reports. This mass of information, embodied largely in English, Hindi and Urdu, typically reflects the biases engendered in the long course of the movement, and dispassionate analyses by contemporary observers are the exception. To a large extent the language of the source indicates the bias: Hindi sources usually reflect a pro-Hindi and Urdu sources a pro-Urdu viewpoint, while English sources contain a whole range of outlooks. Even supposedly neutral sources, such as census reports, did not escape the distorting effects of strongly-held attitudes towards language and script.

Therefore, *The Census of India*, prima facie one of the most valuable sources, has limited worth. The history of those sections dealing with language in the United Provinces, the storm centre of the Hindi movement, shows clearly how bias and inexact terminology rendered linguistic data almost useless. The Census of 1881, the first to include a section on language, made some attempt to estimate speakers of various dialects on the very rough basis of the administrative divisions of the province. The enumerators were instructed to use the term 'Hindustani' for the vernacular, however, thus allowing no accurate estimate of the numbers of speakers of either the regional standards or Hindi vis-a-vis Urdu. Moreover, this census did not recognize the separate existence of Khari Boli as a vernacular dialect, but included it under Braj Bhasha. The Census of 1891, like its predecessor, used language figures gathered by enumerators instructed to use the term 'Hindustani'. The term 'Khari Boli' first appears in this census which made a more exact attempt to estimate the numbers of speakers of various dialects. No mention of the Hindi-Urdu controversy occurred in either census, though both clearly recognized Hindi and Urdu as two separate literary standards.

In contrast, both the Census of 1901 and that of 1911 gave considerable attention to the Hindi-Urdu controversy, and both attempted to collect statistics on the numbers of Hindi and Urdu speakers. Although the two censuses drew on the preliminary results of Dr George Grierson's

Linguistic Survey of India for their linguistic analysis of the provincial dialects, they failed by their own admission to present an accurate picture of the linguistic situation. The strong biases of the enumerators and of an influential portion of the public for or against Hindi and Urdu vitiated the language figures in both years. As a result the Census of 1921 returned to the nineteenth century policy of lumping speakers of Hindi and Urdu under the single category of 'Hindustani'. The two following censuses continued this policy.

The viewpoint of Hindi supporters appears in a number of sources, both English and Hindi. One of the most important English sources, Madan Mohan Malaviya's *Court Character and Primary Education in N.-W. P. and Oudh*, though putting forth a fundamentally flawed argument, has value not only for insights into the thinking of Hindi partisans, but also for extensive quotations from earlier and contemporary sources and for extensive statistics.¹ Another document by a champion of Hindi, Raja Shiva Prasad's *Memorandum: Court Characters, in the Upper Provinces of India*, has particular importance as one of the very first statements explicitly attacking Urdu and defending Hindi as respective symbols of Muslim and Hindu culture.² One of the most invaluable Hindi sources, in addition to the official reports and publications of the Nagari Pracharini Sabha of Banaras, was *Meri Ātmakabānī*, the autobiography of one of the Sabha's three founders, Shyam Sundar Das.³ No other source gives such an intimate picture of the activities of the most important Hindi organization of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and of the motivations and thoughts of a leading advocate of Hindi and the Nagari script.

An especially valuable English source, the *Selections from the Vernacular Newspapers* beginning in 1868 and continuing until 1937, samples a wide range of Indian opinion from both Hindi and Urdu advocates, and furnishes many useful clues about language attitudes and policies not available elsewhere. The coverage of this source, unfortunately, displays considerable inconsistency due to successive officials having different principles of selection. Another indispensable English source, the series of annual education reports for the North-Western Provinces beginning in 1843 and continuing right up to independence, provides not only detailed information on British language and educational policy and Indian reactions, but also essential data on the social backgrounds and language preferences of students in both government and indigenous schools.

The most important English work presenting the viewpoint of Urdu

partisans was *A Defence of the Urdu Language and Character*, published under the auspices of the Urdu Defence Association of Allahabad.⁴ This work, an extended and well-written reply to Malaviya's *Court Character*, gives a thorough account of the arguments against Hindi and Nagari and puts the best face possible on any shortcomings of Urdu and the Urdu script. The contemptuous attitude of Urdu supporters towards their opponents emerges all too clearly. An Urdu source, *Panja Sāla Tārīkh-e-Anjumān Taraqqī-e-Urdū*, has particular usefulness for describing the early years of the Anjuman Taraqqī-e-Urdū (Society for the Progress of Urdu), which became India's most important Urdu organization.⁵ The author's spleen against Sir Antony MacDonnell, who promulgated the orders recognizing Hindi and Nagari in 1900, however, mars his account of events.

One of the dangers lying in wait for the unwary researcher in most of the sources, including those discussed above, comes from the considerable confusion concerning the meaning of several crucial terms, especially 'Hindi' and 'Hindustani'. 'Hindi' has at least four distinct meanings, some of which we have already encountered. First, writers have used the term for several centuries to denote all the spoken dialects of the Hindi regional area, i.e., Braj Bhasha, Avadhi, Bhojpuri, Khari Boli, and other regional standards as well as village dialects. 'Hindi in this sense appears frequently in general discussion of India's major languages. Second, 'Hindi' can refer to 'Hindi-heritage literature', i.e., the literary traditions of regional standards such as Braj Bhasha and Avadhi. This usage occurs frequently in histories of Hindi literature and the polemical writings of Hindi publicists. These same writings often use the term in a third sense to mean 'high Hindi', i.e., highly Sanskritized Khari Boli Hindi. A fourth usage, the vaguest of the lot, implies simply 'that which is not Urdu'. This usage appears in many sources, especially in the vernacular press during the Hindi-Urdu controversy of the nineteenth century. 'Hindustani' has two distinct meanings: this term can refer either to Urdu or to a style of Khari Boli which uses the Nagari or the Urdu script and avoids excess use of Sanskrit, Arabic and Persian words. British writers often use the first sense, while some Indian writers, notably Mahatma Gandhi, use the second.

The confusion and ambiguity apparent in much of the literature stems not only from the distortions of partisanship but also from the inaccurate observations of amateur linguists. As the 1901 Census stated, Grierson's *Linguistic Survey of India* had conclusively shown 'the unscientific nature of the old classifications of the languages and dialects of

the N.-W. Provinces and Oudh [the United Provinces] both according to native ideas and also those of European students who had not the extensive materials now available'.⁶ Modern linguistics did not appear until the early nineteenth century, and trained linguists did not exist in significant numbers until the twentieth. To unravel the tangled skein of evidence, then, becomes a difficult though not impossible task, requiring careful usage of terms and a constant awareness of the bias of the sources.

NOTES

1. Madan Mohan Malaviya, *Court Character and Primary Education in N.-W. P. and Oudh* (Allahabad, 1897). See the section of Chapter V entitled 'The Hindi-Nagari Campaign of 1895-1900' for an extended discussion of this work.
2. Shiva Prasad, *Memorandum: Court Characters, in the Upper Provinces of India* (Banaras, 1868), located in the library of the Nagari Pracharini Sabha, Banaras. See the section of Chapter V entitled 'The Hindi-Urdu Controversy of the 1860s and 1870s' for an analysis of this work.
3. Shyam Sundar Das, *Merī Ātmakāhāni* (Prayāg, 1957).
4. M. Rahmat-Ullah, *A Defence of the Urdu Language and Character. (Being a reply to the pamphlet called 'Court Character and Primary Education in N.-W. P. and Oudh')* (Allahabad, 1900). See the section of Chapter V entitled 'The Aftermath of the 1900 Decision' for a discussion of this work.
5. Sayyed Hashmi Faridabadi, *Panja Sāla Tārīkh-e-Anjumān Taraqqī-e-Urdū* (Karachi, 1953).
6. *Census of India, 1901, Volume XVI, Part I*, pp. 174-5.

Glossary

Geographical, Administrative, and Linguistic Terms

Anjumān-e-Taraqqī-e-Urdū: Society for the Progress of Urdu. Founded in 1903 as an offshoot of the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental Educational Conference. Under the leadership of Maulvi Abdul Haq, the Anjuman became India's and later Pakistan's chief organization for the promotion of Urdu.

Arabic script: A cursive script used for writing most Islamic languages, in which vowels are often not represented and consonants assume different shapes depending on their position in the word. The Persian and Urdu scripts include all the Arabic letters and some additional letters not in the Arabic script. Additionally, the distinctions between certain sounds represented by Arabic letters have been lost in Persian and Urdu.

Avadhi: One of the regional standards of Uttar Pradesh, related to but not identical with Khari Boli Hindi. Spoken mainly in the area of Uttar Pradesh formerly known as Oudh. An important literary language in earlier times; used by the famous medieval poet Tulsidas for the *Rāmcharitmānas*, a recasting of the Sanskrit epic the *Rāmāyana*.

Bhojpuri: Another regional standard. Spoken in eastern Uttar Pradesh and western Bihar, and related to but not identical with Khari Boli Hindi. Listed as a separate language in the 1971 Census of India.

Braj Bhasha: Another regional standard. Spoken in south-western Uttar Pradesh, and closely related to but not identical with Khari Boli Hindi. An important literary language in earlier times and well into the twentieth century.

Dāstān: A Persian literary form incorporated into the Urdu literary tradition; prose romance of magic, love, and adventure.

Devanagari: A synonym for the Nagari script.

Hindi: An often carelessly-used term with several meanings:

(1) Writers have used the term for several centuries to denote all the spoken dialects of the Hindi regional area, i.e., Braj Bhasha, Avadhi, Bhojpuri, Khari Boli, and other regional standards as well as village dialects.

(2) Others use 'Hindi' to refer to 'Hindi-heritage literature', i.e., the literary traditions of regional standards such as Braj Bhasha and Avadhi.

This usage occurs frequently in histories of Hindi literature and the polemical writings of Hindi publicists.

(3) Still others, especially Hindi partisans, use the term to mean 'high Hindi', i.e., highly Sanskritized Khari Boli Hindi.

(4) Others, the vaguest of the lot, use the term to indicate simply 'that which is not Urdu'. This usage appears in many sources, especially in the vernacular press during the Hindi-Urdu controversy of the nineteenth century.

Hindi-Urdu: A term used by some linguists (e.g., Kelkar and Gumperz) to refer to the linguistic continuum formed by these two divisions of Khari Boli. This usage specifically recognizes the practically identical grammars and the large amount of shared vocabulary.

Hindi Sahitya Sammelan: The Society for Hindi Literature. Founded in 1910. Despite its literary name, the Sammelan became the major political force behind the promotion of Hindi and the Nagari script. Some of India's major political figures—e.g., Mahatma Gandhi, Jawaharlal Nehru, and Rajendra Prasad—were members at one time or another.

Hindustani: This term has two distinct meanings:

(1) Urdu.

(2) A style of Khari Boli which uses the Nagari or the Urdu script and avoids excessive use of difficult Sanskrit, Arabic, and Persian words. British writers often use the first sense, while some Indian writers, notably Mahatma Gandhi, use the second.

Hindustani Academy: Founded in 1927 with the official sponsorship of the provincial government. Kayasth literary figures have played an important role in its leadership.

Hunter (Indian Education) Commission: This body, appointed to investigate the educational situation in British India, became in 1882 the centre of an intense language controversy in the Punjab and in the North-Western Provinces and Oudh.

Kaithi: The most important of several different cursive versions of the Nagari script. Widely used in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries by Hindu merchant and trading castes in the NWP&O and Bihar, and also by *patwārīs* (village record keepers) in Oudh, the eastern NWP, and in western Bihar. For several decades, Kaithi became one of the official scripts of Bihar.

Khari Boli: A regional standard of Uttar Pradesh which for various historical reasons became the common grammatical basis of both Hindi and Urdu. Khari Boli Hindi uses the Nagari script and looks to Sanskrit for its higher vocabulary, while the Urdu form of Khari Boli uses the Urdu script (a modified version of the Arabic and Persian scripts) and draws on Arabic and Persian for its higher vocabulary.

Kumaun: A division (group of districts) in the mountainous area of the northwestern NWP&O. The Nagari script was used here from the beginning of British rule in the area.

Mahājanī: One of several cursive varieties of Nagari associated with Hindu merchant and trading castes.

Maithili: A regional standard of Bihar sometimes lumped under the category of Hindi in the past, but listed as a separate language in the 1971 Census of India. According to some, more closely related to Bengali than to Hindi.

Mūḍiyā or Muṇḍā: Another of the several cursive varieties of Nagari associated with Hindu merchant and trading castes.

Nagari: A term with two distinct meanings:

(1) The syllabic script (in which vowels are always indicated, unlike the Urdu script, but are still subordinate to consonants) used for centuries for Sanskrit and earlier Hindi regional standards, as well as modern Khari Boli Hindi and Marathi. Relatives of the Nagari script are used for several other major north Indian languages.

(2) The script *and* Khari Boli Hindi as in 'Nagari Pracharini Sabha' in which 'Nagari' refers to both script and language.

Nagari Pracharini Sabha: Society for the Promotion of Nagari. Founded in 1893, and still in existence, this was the premier Hindi organization of the NWP&O and of India during the end of the nineteenth century and the beginning of the twentieth. The Sabha soon became a primarily literary rather than political body.

North-Western Provinces: A province of British India from 1836 to 1856 whose boundaries fluctuated somewhat, but roughly included all of modern Uttar Pradesh with the exception of Oudh.

North-Western Provinces and Oudh: The predecessor of the United Provinces. Consisted in the North-Western Provinces with the addition of Oudh in 1856; the two were amalgamated in 1877.

Oudh: Formerly a Muslim kingdom, Oudh came under British control in 1856 as a Chief Commissionership, subject to the authority of the Lieutenant-Governor of the North-Western Provinces. In 1877 the two jurisdictions were amalgamated, and the Lieutenant-Governorship and the Chief Commissionership were held by one person. In 1902 the North-Western Provinces and Oudh became the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh and kept this name until 1947, when the area became the state of Uttar Pradesh.

Patwārī: A village record keeper, responsible for various kinds of annual reports.

Persian: The major language of administration in north India for several centuries. Closely associated with Muslim rule, both the Mughal dynasty and its predecessors. Used in British India into the 1830s.

Persian script: A modified version of the Arabic script, adding several letters not in Arabic, but losing some of the distinctions in pronunciation represented by certain Arabic letters.

Regional standard: Regional standards are subdivisions of more major languages, and occur in relatively homogeneous forms over large areas. In Bihar three such standards, formerly included under the category of Hindi, exist: Maithili, Magahi and Bhojpuri. In Uttar Pradesh, four have importance: Bhojpuri in the eastern, Avadhi in the central, Braj Bhasha in the southwestern, and Khari Boli in the northwestern districts. Each of these has large numbers of speakers: the 1901 Census, the last to list such figures for each standard, showed that they included about 95 per cent of the population of the province.

Some of these languages—Maithili, Avadhi, Braj Bhasha, and Khari Boli—have literary traditions of several centuries, while others—Bhojpuri and Magahi—have rich oral folk literatures. Similar regional standards exist in other parts of the Hindi area. Villagers use these to talk with merchants in nearby trading centres and with villagers from other areas. Small town residents use them as their mother tongue, while both educated and uneducated city dwellers use them at home or among friends.

Sarāfī: Another cursive variety of the Nagari script associated with Hindu merchant and trading castes. Also, a synonym for *mabājanī* and *muṇḍā*.

Saugor and Nerbudda Territories: (From the town of Sagar and the River

Narmada.) A hilly area in central India, formerly administered by the NWP&O which became part of the Central Provinces and is now divided between the states of Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra.

Shikasta: Literally, 'broken'. An abbreviated or shorthand form of the Persian script and Urdu scripts used by officials to keep records, and notorious for its extreme illegibility.

Tabsil: A revenue subdivision of a district in British India.

United Provinces: In full, the United Provinces of Agra and Oudh. The official name for the North-Western Provinces and Oudh after 1902. The United Provinces became the state of Uttar Pradesh in 1947.

Urdu: The form of Khari Boli which uses the Urdu script, borrows much of its higher vocabulary from Persian and Arabic, and has strong associations with the Muslim community. Urdu became one of the two official languages of Pakistan, along with English, and very recently (1989) an additional official language in Uttar Pradesh.

Urdu script: A modified version of the Persian script. The Urdu script has added some letters and sounds, the retroflex series, which do not exist in Persian or Arabic, but are common to most major north and south Indian languages. Like the Persian script, it has lost some of the distinctions in pronunciation represented by certain Arabic letters.

Uttar Pradesh: Literally, 'the state of the north'. The successor to the United Provinces.

Theoretical Terms

Assimilation: A process of change which brings different peoples or ethnic groups within the same political system into the same network of social communication. The rate of assimilation must keep ahead of that of social mobilization, if differentiation is not to result.

Community: This term refers to an ethnic group whose members have developed an awareness of their common identity and seek to define group boundaries.

Differentiation: This process, the opposite to assimilation, separates peoples or ethnic groups into different networks of social communication. When the rate of social mobilization outstrips the rate of assimilation, differentiation takes place.

Ethnic Group: This term, defined as any group of individuals with some objective characteristics in common, also refers to groups whose members do not necessarily give any subjective importance to their objective distinctness.

Multi-Symbol Congruence: This term refers to the process by which political elites choose one symbol as primary and strive to bring other symbols into line.

Nationality: This term refers to a community which makes political demands with a significant degree of success.

Objective Characteristic: This refers to such things as language, culture, territory, diet, dress, etc. rather than to any role in a societal division of labour.

Social Mobilization: This is a process of change occurring in areas undergoing modernization, which brings increasing numbers of the more isolated portions of the population into an ever denser 'net of social communication'. This 'mobilized population' includes literates, newspaper readers, people residing in cities and towns, people in non-agricultural occupations, and others.

Note: For a brief discussion of the categories of sounds (retroflex or cerebral, guttural, palatal, dental, labial, etc.) the reader may refer to any standard grammar such as Snell and Weightman's *Teach Yourself Hindi*.

Abbreviations

- Bengal Quarterly Pubs Rpt: Statement of Particulars Regarding Books and Periodicals Published in Bengal . . .*
- Bengal Gen Progs Misc: Proceedings of the Government of Bengal in the General Department (Miscellaneous)*
- CP Admin Rpt: Report on the Administration of the Central Provinces*
- CP Home Progs: Central Provinces Home Proceedings (General)*
- Educ Comm Rpt: Report of the Indian Education Commission (Calcutta, 1883)*
- Educ Comm Rpt Bengal: Education Commission: Report by the Bengal Provincial Committee (Calcutta, 1884)*
- Educ Comm Rpt CP: Education Commission: Report by the Central Provinces Provincial Committee (Calcutta, 1884)*
- Educ Comm Rpt NWP&O: Education Commission: Report by the North-Western Provinces and Oudh Provincial Committee (Calcutta, 1884)*
- NPS Ann Rpt: Nagari Pracharini Sabha Kashi: Varşik Vivaran (Annual Report)*
- NWP: North-Western Provinces*
- NWP Educ Rpt: Report on the State of Popular Education in the North-Western Provinces*
- NWP Gen Dept Progs: Proceedings of the Government of the N.-W. Provinces in the General and Educational Department*
- NWP SVN: Selections from the Vernacular Newspapers Published in the Panjab, North-Western Provinces . . .*
- NWP&O: North-Western Provinces and Oudh*
- NWP&O Gen Admin Progs: Proceedings of the Government of the N.-W. Provinces and Oudh in the General Administration Department*
- NWP&O Quarterly Pubs Rpt: Statement of Particulars Regarding Books and Periodicals Published in the North-Western Provinces and Oudh . . .*
- NWP&O SVN: Selections from the Vernacular Newspapers Published in the Panjab, North-Western Provinces and Oudh . . .*
- SRGI: Selections from the Records of the Government of India . . .*
- UP: United Provinces of Agra and Oudh; Uttar Pradesh*
- UP Admin Rpt: United Provinces of Agra and Oudh Administration Report*
- UP Educ Progs: Proceedings of the Government of the United Provinces in the Educational Department*
- UP Quarterly Pubs Rpt: Statement of Particulars Regarding Books and Periodicals Published in the United Provinces . . .*
- UP SVN: Selections from the Vernacular Newspapers Published in the United Provinces . . .*